



# Understanding human trafficking as a market system: addressing the demand side of trafficking for sexual exploitation

Alexis A. Aronowitz, Anneke Koning

IN **REVUE INTERNATIONALE DE DROIT PÉNAL** 2014/3-4 Vol. 85 , PAGES 669 TO 696

PUBLISHER **ÉRÈS**

ISSN 0223-5404

ISBN 9782749246499

DOI 10.3917/ridp.853.0669

Uploaded: 04/13/2015

Article available online at

<https://droit.cairn.info/journal-revue-internationale-de-droit-penal-2014-3-page-669?lang=en>



Discover the contents of this issue, follow the journal by email, subscribe...  
Scan this QR code to access the page for this issue on Cairn.info.



**Electronic distribution Cairn.info for érès.**

You are authorized to reproduce this article within the limits of the terms of use of Cairn.info or, where applicable, the terms and conditions of the license subscribed to by your institution. Details and conditions can be found at [cairn.info/copyright](http://cairn.info/copyright).

Unless otherwise provided by law, the digital use of these resources for educational purposes is subject to authorization by the Publisher or, where applicable, by the collective management organization authorized for this purpose. This is particularly the case in France with the CFC, which is the approved organization in this area.

# UNDERSTANDING HUMAN TRAFFICKING AS A MARKET SYSTEM: ADDRESSING THE DEMAND SIDE OF TRAFFICKING FOR SEXUAL EXPLOITATION

Alexis A. ARONOWITZ / Anneke KONING\*

## Résumé

Pour comprendre pleinement le succès du trafic d'êtres humains, il est nécessaire de le considérer comme un marché où les trafiquants génèrent des profits en répondant à la demande de services fournis par les personnes faisant l'objet du trafic. Cet article applique cette approche fondée sur le marché de l'offre et de la demande au trafic d'êtres humains en vue d'exploitation sexuelle, et analyse les diverses formes et les divers contextes sociaux et culturels qui constituent et encouragent la demande pour ce type de services. Il tente ainsi d'expliquer pourquoi l'exploitation sexuelle de victimes de trafic est un phénomène plus récurrent dans certaines sociétés que dans d'autres. L'auteur s'attache également à distinguer dans la chaîne du trafic la demande de trois différents groupes : le client (ou demande d'origine), les employeurs des personnes exploitées sexuellement et les tiers impliqués dans le trafic (recruteurs, organisateurs des voyages, transporteurs), à la source d'une demande dérivée. Il identifie en outre les arguments de vente propres aux personnes exploitées sexuellement – prix bas, docilité, jeunesse et exotisme : des qualités qui constituent autant des risques pour de nombreuses jeunes femmes d'être conduites à la prostitution. Pour conclure, l'article analyse les solutions introduites dans plusieurs États pour limiter toute demande, la demande d'origine et la demande dérivée.

## Abstract

To fully understand how human trafficking thrives, one must analyze it as a market system where traffickers make profits by meeting the demand for services supplied by trafficked persons. This article describes this supply and demand market-based approach to

---

\* Alexis A. Aronowitz, PhD University College Utrecht, Utrecht University. P.O. Box 80145. 3508 TC Utrecht. The Netherlands

Tel: + 31 20 638 2019 (home)

Email: [a.a.aronowitz@uu.nl](mailto:a.a.aronowitz@uu.nl)

Academic Affiliations: Loyola University of New Orleans (Bachelor of Criminal Justice); State University of New York @ Albany (Master's and PhD).

A. Koning, M.Phil. Lecturer in Criminology

Email: [a.koning@law.leidenuniv.nl](mailto:a.koning@law.leidenuniv.nl)

Faculty / Department: Faculteit Rechtsgeleerdheid, Instituut voor Strafrecht & Criminologie, Criminologie. Office Address: Kamerlingh Onnes Gebouw. Steenschuur 25. 2311 ES Leiden. The Netherlands

trafficking in human beings for sexual exploitation and examines the various forms and social and cultural contexts that compose and foster demand for sexual services. It also examines the demand for (trafficked) sex workers generated within the context of the trafficking business chain by three distinct groups: the customers or clients of trafficked persons (*primary demand*), the employers of (trafficked) sex workers and third parties involved in the trafficking process (recruiters, travel agents, transporters) who generate *derived demand*. The article further identifies the so called *unique selling points* of trafficked persons exploited for forced prostitution and other sexual services, demanded by clients – low cost, malleability, youthful and exotic – as qualities that put many young women at risk of being trafficked into prostitution. It also explores why the use of prostitutes –possibly supplied by trafficked victims– is more prevalent in some societies than others. In conclusion, a discussion focuses on measures that have been introduced in a number of countries to reduce both primary and other derived demand.

### Resumen

Para entender en toda su extensión cómo prospera la trata de seres humanos, hay que analizarla como un sistema de mercado donde los traficantes obtienen ganancias mediante la satisfacción de la demanda de los servicios prestados por las víctimas de trata. En este artículo se describe este enfoque mercantilista de oferta y demanda para la trata de seres humanos con fines de explotación sexual y examina las diversas formas y contextos sociales y culturales que la componen y fomentan la demanda de servicios sexuales. También examina la demanda de (trata de) trabajadores sexuales generada en el contexto de la cadena de negocio del tráfico por tres grupos distintos de sujetos: los compradores o clientes de las víctimas de trata (*demanda primaria*), los empleadores de trabajadores (de trata) del sexo y los terceros implicados en el proceso de la trata (reclutadores, agentes de viajes, transportistas) que generan la *demanda derivada*. En el artículo se identifican los llamados *puntos de venta exclusivos* de las personas objeto de trata explotadas en la prostitución forzada y otros servicios sexuales, solicitados por los clientes - bajo costo, maleabilidad, juventud y exotismo - como cualidades que ponen a muchas mujeres jóvenes en riesgo de ser víctimas de trata para la prostitución. También explora por qué el uso de las prostitutas - posiblemente suministrados por las víctimas de la trata - es más frecuente en algunas sociedades que en otras. En conclusión, la discusión se centra en las medidas que se han introducido en varios países para reducir tanto la demanda principal como la derivada.

### Introduction

Human trafficking, the modern day slave trade, is defined in Article 3 of the United Nations Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children (2000)<sup>1</sup> as

---

<sup>1</sup> The Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, Supplementing the United Nations Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime (2000) can be downloaded from the internet at

*“... the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labor or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs.”*

Human trafficking can take on different forms, as exploitation can be prevalent in so many different sectors and ways. Sexual exploitation is the most researched and well-known type of human trafficking and is, according to UNODC statistics, by far the most commonly identified type of trafficking: 79% of detected trafficking victims across 52 countries were victims of sexual exploitation, 18% of forced labor and 3% of other forms (UNODC, 2009).<sup>2</sup> Women and children are particularly vulnerable to sexual and other forms of exploitation: the majority of identified trafficking victims are women (66%), girls (13%), and boys (9%) (UNODC, 2009).<sup>3</sup> These numbers changed as reflected in UNODC's 2012 report. Still, 58% of victims of trafficking were identified as victims of sexual exploitation; of all victims of trafficking identified in 2009, 59% were women and 17% were girls (UNODC, 2012).

Although accounts about the volume of human trafficking have been plagued with definitional issues and methodological difficulties (see e.g. Laczko & Gramegna, 2003; Salt & Hogarth, 2000, Aronowitz, 2009), the International Labor Organization estimates that 2.45 million persons worldwide are victims of forced labor as a result of human trafficking (International Labour Organization, 2005). Based on his research, Bales (2004) estimates the number of individuals involved in human trafficking or 'slavery' worldwide at approximately 27 million. Trafficking in human beings is therefore a sizable, but also a global problem: it has been documented in more than 180 countries (U.S. Department of State, 2012).

More and more effective measures to tackle human trafficking for the purpose of (sexual) exploitation are essential. To develop and implement these measures, academics, law enforcement officers, politicians and other parties committed to

---

[http://www.uncjin.org/Documents/Conventions/dcatoc/final\\_documents\\_2/convention\\_%20traff\\_eng.pdf](http://www.uncjin.org/Documents/Conventions/dcatoc/final_documents_2/convention_%20traff_eng.pdf)

<sup>2</sup> It should be noted that the UNODC data represents only documented cases. Since prostitution and sexual exploitation are likely to be more visible than other forms of trafficking, these cases could be more frequently identified, resulting in a statistical bias.

<sup>3</sup> Men comprised 12% of the identified victims. Data was provided on 61 countries (UNODC, 2009).

reducing human trafficking must understand human trafficking as a profitable market in a globalized world. As such, Part I of this paper provides a comprehensive overview of human trafficking as a market and different types of demand, while Part II proposes some measures to tackle this demand.

### **Human Trafficking as a Market System**

The analysis of human trafficking is evolving from a narrow examination of its perpetrators and victims to a more extensive understanding of human trafficking as a market system. The utility of this market-based perspective is grounded in its economic approach and is based on the (rational choice) assumption that traffickers primarily and most importantly engage in trafficking because it generates huge profits (Aronowitz, 2010). The market in exploited workers for commercial sex is therefore similar to other illicit markets: the goods are human beings, the demand is for prostitution and other forms of cheap and malleable labor, the goods (supply) and demands are dynamically matched, and there is a complex social network operating to make this happen (Williams, 1997; Pennington et al., 2009).

The market system in which human trafficking for sexual exploitation occurs, in which victims are treated like commodities which are bought, sold, traded and used, is widely stigmatized, partially criminalized and poorly regulated (Anderson and O'Connell Davidson, 2003). This trafficking market is fostered – if not created – by three underlying factors: the seemingly endless supply of persons 'available' for exploitation in the source countries; the endless demand for the services they provide in destination countries; and organized criminal networks which have "taken control of this economic "supply and demand" situation to traffic and exploit trafficked persons in order to generate enormous profits" (Bales, no date:1-2).

#### *Supply*

In this market system, *supply* refers to the source or objective availability of services. The supply of individuals willing to migrate and work is almost endless.<sup>4</sup> With respect to the supply side of the trafficking process, "eternal human yearning for improving one's life makes people vulnerable to the lures of trafficking" (U.S. State Department, 2005:8). The steady supply of persons trying to improve their lives, or those of their children, is created by a climate of (relative) poverty and political and/or social exclusion; a lack of educational or employment opportunities; domestic violence, discrimination and violence against women,

---

<sup>4</sup> The size and scope of the supply of persons available for exploitation is influenced by cultural contexts. Protective community factors reducing the risk of exploitation render it difficult to recruit women and children into the sex industry in some places. Although the supply of vulnerable and exploitable individuals is almost endless from a recruitment point of view, on a local level there is utility in preventive measures aimed at reducing said vulnerability.

children or ethnic minorities; government corruption; persecution; absence of the rule of law; and natural disasters and war (U.S. State Department, 2005; Europol, 2009, Aronowitz, 2009). Furthermore, cultural practices of child fosterage in certain societies may facilitate the illegal adoption or exploitation of child (domestic) workers (Aronowitz, 2006).

Globalization has (re)shaped the supply and demand side of the increasingly transnational human trafficking market in several ways. Firstly, globalization has served to not only increase the supply of exploitable workers, but also the demand for them. Increased competition from non-domestic markets has led to global pressure on employers to reduce production costs by any available means. Traffickers take advantage of this increasing need for cost efficiency and cheap labor by acting as intermediaries, offering low-cost labor in exchange for a profit – and in their search for cheap labor, employers such as brothel (or factory) owners sometimes remain indifferent to violating the human rights of their employees. Globalization has thus acted as a catalyst for increased demand for cheap products and thus cheap labor. Since exploited labor is by definition cheap and profitable, it has also acted as a catalyst for increased demand for trafficked persons.

Additionally, the lowering of trade restrictions of international borders, the increased cross-border traffic and the declining distinction between domestic and international markets have given criminal organizations the opportunity to conduct transnational operations around the world and at an international level (Schloenhardt, 1999). The ease of movement of goods, services and capital has increased in regions where borders are porous or where the external borders have expanded and Member States' citizens are allowed to travel legally and visa-free between countries, thereby reducing the risk of detection for traffickers.

Thirdly, globalization has influenced key “push”-factors in societies which increase the vulnerability of specific groups and make them more susceptible to trafficking and transnational crime. The spread of technology and market forces have put pressure on traditional cultures and have, in some cases, led to severed community bonds. The damage to these crucial societal ties leaves certain groups marginalized, excluded and/or impoverished, making them extra vulnerable to exploitation. Additionally, the increased consumerism and materialism associated with globalization can lead to a global anomie where large portions of a population do not have the means to acquire the so strongly desired consumer goods. In an attempt to acquire the money to access these goods, the turn to transnational crime (either as perpetrator or as migrant) is in some societies promoted (Passas, 1999).

### *Demand*

In investigating the causes underlying human trafficking, previous research has often focused on (the causes of) the supply and delivery of trafficked persons. Research has also examined the traffickers who supply the victims and the systems and means by which they operate. Equally important, but receiving less attention, is the demand side of human trafficking.

Within the context of trafficking, there is no agreed upon definition of the term “demand”. In marketing and economics, *demand* typically refers to “the desire and preference for a particular commodity, labor or service” (ILO, 2006:15). Demand can be elastic or inelastic: whereas elastic demand for a service fluctuates depending on the price of the good or service, inelastic demand for a product or service remains stable despite price fluctuation, meaning that consumers will pay almost any price for the product or service. In the case of sex trafficking, the demand for cheap sex is highly elastic: a price increase will lead to a reduction in demand (Kara, 2009). Conversely, a greater availability of individuals providing services at lower prices will result in more customers, hence, greater demand.

In the case of prostitution, worldwide demand has always existed. The booming sex industry is fueled almost exclusively by males purchasing the sexual services of women, girls, boys and men. The sex industry is expanding from traditional brothels and street prostitution to escort services, “private clubs” and residences, massage parlors, advertisements through the internet and online (child) pornography. The male demand for prostitution is said to be the “most immediate and proximate cause” contributing to the expansion of the sex industry. Were it not for men’s demand to purchase sex, pimps, recruiters and traffickers would not generate a profit and “the prostitution market would go broke” (Raymond, 2004:1160).

In examining demand for trafficked sex workers, three distinct groups can be identified. The first group comprises *customers or clients* of trafficked persons; this is referred to as *primary demand*.

The second and third groups are the *employers* (owners, pornographic film producers, managers of brothels or massage parlors) and *third parties* involved in the trafficking process (recruiters, travel agents, transporters). These groups expect to generate revenues from human trafficking and create what is referred to as *derived demand*.

Demand is heavily influenced not only by prices, costs and revenues, but also by social and cultural contexts, attitudes and practices within a country, and is more prevalent among certain occupational groups. The exploitation of women in the booming billion dollar commercial sex and entertainment industry is driven by “... the unequal power relations that exist in patriarchal societies, power relations that

sexualize women and objectify them for consumption" (Goward, 2003:no page), which are more prevalent in certain societies and cultures than they are in others.

#### *The Trafficking Business Chain*

A crucial difference between primary and derived demand is not only whether the person generating it is making a profit, but also their chronological order in the trafficking chain. Human trafficking as a crime is not based on a single event but can be seen as a process or chain from recruitment and transportation, through employment, exploitation and purchase (Aronowitz, 2009). The demand for trafficked persons occurs on three different levels (or stages) of personal or institutional demand related to human trafficking.

Derived demand is created at the beginning of the trafficking chain or process by recruiters, agents, transporters and others who facilitate the recruitment, harboring and transportation of trafficked persons for (commercial) sexual exploitation. At the middle of the trafficking chain, the second level of derived demand is formed by the employers, owners, managers of brothels, or those who may "order" women, children or men who meet certain specifications or match the characteristics or *unique selling points* desired by their customers or clients. The third level of demand is primary and created at the end of the trafficking chain by the customers or clients of the prostitutes, consumers of child pornography or other victims being sexually exploited.

#### *The Relationship between Supply and Demand*

Supply and demand are intricately interwoven and their relationship is complex. A multi-country study of the demand side of human trafficking for commercial sexual services and domestic labor found that demand for such services is "... intimately related to questions concerning supply and vulnerability; indeed, we could almost say that supply generates demand rather than the other way around" (Anderson and O'Connell Davidson, 2003:41). It has been argued that it is the market – or supply – in trafficked women which creates the demand – not the customers (Newman, 2006). While traditional market theory operates on the presumption that demand creates supply, a steady *supply* of unskilled (migrant) workers willing to accept jobs or provide services can sometimes generate the demand for such services and labor, rather than vice versa (Anderson and O'Connell Davidson, 2002; Newman, 2006).

Supply and demand are shaped "...by a complex and interlocking set of political, social, institutional and economic factors" (Anderson and O'Connell Davidson, 2002:54). Demand is created as a result of the availability of a service. Anderson and O'Connell Davidson (2002:26) provide the following as an illustration to support their argument:

For example, in the poor and developing world, many children work as "shoe-shine boys", whereas few do so in the affluent world. The absence

of this form of child labour in affluent countries and its presence in poorer nations cannot be explained through reference to different levels of absolute demand for shoe-shiners' labour. Here, as elsewhere, the relationship between supply and demand is mediated by a range of economic and social factors, as well as by government policies on employment (including child labour), immigration, education, and welfare.

In an empirical econometric analysis of supply and demand determinants of sex trafficking, the ILO (Danailova-Trainor & Belser, 2006) identified the two most important factors contributing to human trafficking. Supply is influenced by youth unemployment or underemployment, especially for females, in a country; there is a statistical correlation between the level of female youth unemployment and the number of victims trafficked out of a country. Furthermore, demand for trafficked victims is higher in countries that are more open to globalization and that have more prostitution (Danailova-Trainor & Belser, 2006). Another important factor influencing supply in source countries is the presence of organized crime (Shelley, 2010). Shelley argues that organized crime brings them together.

While markets may be driven by supply and demand, it is argued that they are influenced by the 'institutional framework' or responses to the trafficking market within a society, which include cultural variables as well as the existence and enforcement of laws and the success of prosecutions and punishments.

### **Trafficked Victims' "Unique Selling Points"**

It is unimaginable to assume and difficult to prove that a specific primary demand exists for the labor or services of a *trafficked* sex worker. Although there is a crucial conceptual distinction between the demand for labor and services in general and the demand for labor and services of trafficked persons – the former does not violate fundamental human rights and the latter does –, in practice these two might be indistinguishable. The consumer of services may not be aware that the labor or service is provided by a trafficked person, and likewise, it is hard to imagine a prostitution customer specifically looking for a trafficked prostitute and rejecting all others. Instead, "it makes more sense to assume that the niceties of international and national law on trafficking, and the nature of a person's journey into vulnerability and bondage, are *irrelevant* to those who exploit or consume their labor/services" (Anderson & O'Connell Davidson, 2003:9, emphasis added). Therefore, consumer demand for prostitution need not specifically refer to the desire for a *trafficked* prostitute.

Demand for a particular product or service can also be understood in terms of its *unique selling points*. Bales (2005:158) defines these as specific features or attributes that differentiate a product from similar products and that "...feed into an existing or cultivated demand on the part of consumers." This marketing concept can also be applied to the trafficking market in human beings. Instead of

merely stating that there is a general consumer demand for prostitutes or domestic workers which is sometimes met by trafficking victims, the concept of unique selling points stresses that a specific demand for trafficked or exploited persons does exist, not because clients or employers want to purchase the labor of trafficked persons specifically, but because they are looking to purchase persons with certain specific characteristics which trafficked victims often possess. Trafficked laborers therefore have some unique attributes that may differentiate them from non-trafficked laborers, rendering their services more attractive to purchase.

Especially in the sex industry, it is important to understand that employers of labor and consumers of services do not always simply want to purchase a concrete “thing”, but rather wish to consume what is referred to as “embodied labor”: they are looking to make use of the services/labor of persons of a specific age, sex, race, nationality, or class (Anderson & O’Connell Davidson, 2002). This is particularly clear in consumers of commercial sex acts. While in essence consumers of prostitution or other forms of sexual exploitation are looking for a certain “thing”, few clients would be equally happy to purchase services from an elderly man as they would be from a young woman, indicating the embodiment of the worker’s labor. The demand may be for women of a certain nationality (Russian), ethnic group (Asian) or age (particularly young children) or having a certain attribute (being a virgin). What then, are the unique selling points that make trafficked victims interesting to consumers of prostitution and other forms of sexual exploitation?

Research has shown that certain occupational groups of men (such as truckers, sailors, military or peacekeeping forces, traveling businessmen and tourists) are more likely to purchase the services of prostitutes (e.g. Monto, 1999; Otsuki and Hatano, 2009). Men motivate their use of prostitutes with the desire for particular kinds of sexual partners or a certain kind of sexual experience, the desire to be able to control when and how to have sex, or for companionship (Anderson and O’Connell Davidson, 2004). The demand of men who purchase sex may be influenced by the following considerations – the unique selling points of trafficked victims.

#### *Low Cost*

Given the fact that the demand for sexual service is elastic, price fluctuations have a strong impact on demand (Kara, 2009). Research on the groups most likely to purchase sex has shown that men tend to purchase sex in cities and countries where commercial sex is cheaper. Prostitutes in border towns see an influx of “sex tourists” from neighboring countries where the price of prostitutes is higher. This thriving sex tourism has seen Finnish and to a lesser extent Swedish

men travel to cities in Northwest Russia<sup>5</sup> and Germans travel to various Czech border towns.<sup>6</sup> Likewise, during times of economic recession, clients are known to bargain with the prostitutes for cheaper prices. In downtown Toronto, the current economic crisis has caused the plunge of average prices for street prostitutes' services from \$60 to \$20 for oral sex and from \$150 to \$80 for intercourse (Crawford, 2009). In this particular case, it can be theorized that the demand for street prostitution has decreased due to the clients' overall tighter budgets, but simultaneously the supply of prostitutes may have increased due to the financial crisis, leading to a double-curve shift which caused the plummeting of prices. These reflections suggest that price is an important consideration for many purchasers of sex and that when sexual services are supplied more cheaply, levels of demand may rise (Anderson and O'Connell Davidson, 2004).

It is easy to see why the price of (services provided by) trafficked sex workers would be lower in comparison with their more expensive voluntary counterparts. In the exploitative trafficking process, trafficked victims are not only "low cost products" for the consumers, but also for the traffickers earning the profits from their labor. Trafficked sex workers can be forced by brothel, massage parlor and sex shop owners into working long hours for little or no pay. Although some expenses need to be made to keep the business running – costs incurred as a result of transportation, documents, smuggling fees or rent, as well as costs aimed at reducing the risk of detection, such as bribes – salary expenses are small to non-existent and the costs can easily be passed on to the trafficked victim in the form of debts.

#### *Malleability*

Trafficked persons, through deceit, force, threats, violence, intimidation and isolation are molded into malleable persons from whom traffickers, pimps, brothel owners and employers can extract the maximum profit from their forced labor. Bales (no date:6) defines malleability as "...the ability of the consumer to force the enslaved trafficked person to do anything they require, or to do anything they want to the trafficked person." Malleability or control of the victim, brought about initially through physical coercion (e.g. sexual assault) combined with malnutrition, sleep deprivation, isolation, psychological intimidation, threats to family members, and the withholding of documents, is exacerbated by the fact that the victim is often isolated, does not speak the local language and is unfamiliar with his/her surroundings.

---

<sup>5</sup> Anderson and O'Connell Davidson (2004) citing IAF (International Abolitionist Federation), 2001: Special Issue: Prostitution in the Nordic Countries. *International Abolitionist Federation Newsletter*. August, and Rusakova, M., 2001.

<sup>6</sup> Anderson and O'Connell Davidson (2004) citing Siden, A., 2002: *Warte Mall Prostitution after the Velvet Revolution*. London: Hayward Gallery.

Malleability is a unique selling point for both traffickers and purchasers of sexually exploited persons. Being able to easily manipulate and control the victim ensures that (s)he will not try to escape or cooperate with the authorities if an investigation is initiated. The fact that traffickers in some Western European countries reportedly recruit prostitutes working in their own (Eastern European) countries ensures their compliance (Aronowitz, 2009). For the customer or client of the trafficked victim, malleability or compliance ensures that his wishes are granted without resistance. Trafficked victims are rarely able to “set limits on the nature and terms of their encounters with clients” (Anderson and O’Connell Davidson, 2004:22). Trafficked prostitutes can therefore more easily be forced to engage in more “exotic” and unusual sex acts or to comply with the client’s requests for unprotected sexual intercourse than their non-trafficked counterparts.

#### *Youthful Prostitutes*

In a multiple-country study of clients who purchased sex, researchers found that “just over three-quarters of all clients surveyed expressed a preference for prostitutes aged 25 or under, with 22% stating a preference for those aged 18 or below”, in spite of the fact that two thirds of the clients were between the ages of 31 and 50 at the time of the study. “Despite their own advance towards middle age and beyond, youth was still a quality that most clients in all countries sought in sex workers (Anderson and O’Connell Davidson, 2003:19).

While trafficked persons are more likely to provide cheaper and more malleable sex services than non-trafficked individuals, commercial sex with persons under the age of consent is always exploitative.<sup>7</sup> The specific demand for young prostitutes can be motivated by different consumer beliefs and interests. It may be tied to the desire for prostitutes who are “sexually innocent”, inexperienced, undemanding and passive. They may be more malleable than older, more experienced prostitutes who are more likely to set boundaries. Some clients have a specific sexual interest in pre-adolescent children: an interest they can act upon through sex tourism. Yet others act upon key misconceptions and myths about sexual health which particularly prevail in Asia and Africa: for instance, the belief that having intercourse with a child can cure HIV/AIDS, can improve potency or will bring good luck in business ventures (Hughes, 2005; Anderson and O’Connell Davidson, 2002).

Included in the market for young children is the more specific market for virgins. The myths regarding ‘healing powers’ of having sex with young children apply equally if not more to virgins, creating an immense demand for this exclusive ‘consumer good’. Particularly in Asia, “virgins are an elite commodity sought by high ranking or wealthy individuals who can afford to buy a rare human

---

<sup>7</sup> The United Nations’ Convention on the Rights of the Child defines a child as a person under the age of 18.

commodity that is forever changed after the man is finished with her" (Hughes, 2005:25). After being sold as a virgin, a girl may be resold as a virgin or inexperienced girl a few more times. However, the value of her services quickly falls and to her customers she becomes a prostitute like all the others.

*The Exotic versus the Same*

According to Hughes (2004) there is evidence of a growing demand for foreign women of various ethnic backgrounds by customers of prostitutes. Men's sexual expectations are driven by myths and ethnic stereotypes. Some men sexualize the "exotic" – those of other ethnic or racial backgrounds, or national identities. Research carried out on white Western male sex tourists in Latin America and the Caribbean, and Southeast Asian countries, reveals that they "...simultaneously sexualise racially "othered" persons, and de-sexualise white women" (Anderson and O'Connell Davidson, 2002:23). For example, African-American prostitutes in the United States have to fight against a cultural stereotype of black women being overly sexual and "animalistic" (Carter, 2003:215). For sex tourists who travel specifically to engage in commercial sex acts with foreign prostitutes, their 'otherness' creates a feeling of surrealism and exempts the client from any moral responsibility while engaging in acts which would be unacceptable or illegal in his own country (Roby and Tanner, 2009).

Another pattern may emerge. Once sex workers of a particular nationality or ethnic background begin working in a country (as either freelance sex workers or trafficked victims), a market for this particular "type" of sex worker may be established. This in turn generates demand which employers (pimp, brothel and massage parlor owners) and third parties (recruiters, transporters) are willing to fill.

Although clients and employers to an extent value "the exotic", at the same time it is important that sex workers are within certain limits of sameness: a balance needs to be found between these two contradictory selling points. This balancing act is also often found in the marketing of day-to-day products, where every candy bar is profiled as being different to the rest, "wild" or "exotic," while at the same time certain boundaries of sameness are being upheld (Bales, no date). "Sameness" can therefore for some clients be a prostitute's unique selling point which matches the demand generated for particular victims who meet certain criteria desired by the client base. For example, the Mexican Cadena family created a market for sexual services among illegal migrant workers in Florida and then supplied the men with often-underage women trafficked from Mexico. The young women were beaten and threatened (Aronowitz, 2009).<sup>8</sup>

---

<sup>8</sup> Between August 1996 and February 1998, Hugo Cadena-Sosa lured women and girls from Mexico to Florida promising them good jobs and better lives. Instead, they were forced into prostitution and held as sexual slaves in brothel houses in Florida and the

### Social and Cultural Contexts that Support Human Trafficking<sup>9</sup>

There are a number of components which create or make up the demand side of trafficking for sexual exploitation. In addition to the men who buy commercial sex acts (or child pornography) and the exploiters who make up the sex industry – those who “order” or purchase women for their brothels and clubs – Hughes (2005) identifies two other components which support the demand side of human trafficking. These are (1) the laws and policies toward exploited labor and prostitution in destination countries<sup>10</sup> and (2) the culture that condones or promotes (sexual) exploitation. While the laws, policies and culture in destination countries are not direct measures of demand, by normalizing prostitution, the laws of a country may inadvertently work as facilitators which allow trafficking markets to flourish. It is also probable that a culture does not condone sexual exploitation, but normalizes the purchase of sex allowing prostitution to flourish and trafficking to exist.

Perhaps a measure of the degree to which a culture condones the purchase of sex can be measured by the percentage of men in a society who purchase sex. This figure varies widely among cultures and countries. A small-scale pilot study on the primary demand side of trafficking involved interviews and surveys with clients who had purchased sex acts (as well as those who had not done so) in Denmark, India, Italy and Thailand. The study found significant differences with regard to the extent and nature of the social acceptance of men in different countries to purchase sex. While, for instance, Danish men said they never experienced social pressure to buy sex, Thai men viewed purchasing sex acts as “part of a rite of passage, as well as a ritual to consolidate relationships with male friends” (Anderson and O’Connell Davidson, 2003:17).

In Europe the percentage of men who purchase sex acts varies from a low of 7 percent in Great Britain, followed by Russia (10%), Norway (11%), Finland (13%), Sweden (13%), the Netherlands (14%), Switzerland (19%), to a high of 39

---

Carolinas. The victims were forced to work at the Cadena’s brothel houses as prostitutes until they paid the Cadena family a \$2,000 smuggling fee. In some cases, the victims were locked in a room with no windows and given no money and were threatened with beatings and reprisal attacks against their families in Mexico. Those who attempted to escape were hunted down, returned to the brothels, beaten, and subjected to confinement (U.S. Department of Justice, 2002).

<sup>9</sup> Parts of this section were taken from a report prepared by the author for the Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE) and the United Nations Global Initiative to Fight Human Trafficking (UN.GIFT). See Aronowitz (2010).

<sup>10</sup> Hughes (2005:8) argues that “By tolerating or legalizing prostitution, the state, at least passively, is contributing to the demand for victims. The more states regulate prostitution and derive tax revenue from it, the more actively they become part of the demand for victims”.

percent in Spain (Månsson, 2004). In Asian countries, the percentage of men who purchase sex acts appears to be higher, with reports of 37 percent in Japan and 73 percent in Thailand (Anderson and O'Connell Davidson, 2003:17)<sup>11</sup>. A national health study carried out in the United States found that 16 percent of men had ever purchased a sex act, but only 0.6 percent of men did so on a regular basis (Monto, 1999, citing the National Health and Life Survey, 1992).

It is clear that demand and trafficking markets must be studied within the specific context of a given country and at a given time. Trafficking operations are flexible and change – recruitment, transportation, trafficking and smuggling routes and types of victims can shift with response to market supply, demand and criminal justice responses.

### **Measures to Reduce Primary Demand**

Article 9(5) of the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children, calls upon State Parties to "...adopt or strengthen legislative or other measures, such as educational, social or cultural measures, including through bilateral and multilateral cooperation, to discourage the demand that fosters all forms of exploitation of persons, especially women and children, that leads to trafficking" (UNODC, 2000; 5). Having elaborated on the workings of human trafficking as a market system, the different types of demand, the unique selling points that make trafficked victims particularly attractive for both consumers and employers, and the social and cultural contexts that promote and support this demand, we now examine different interventions that law enforcement agencies, governments and community organizations can employ to tackle demand for the services of trafficked victims. The remainder of this paper will focus first on measures reducing demand among clients through repressive, legislative, educational, cultural and social measures – a development primarily based on the assumption that at least a proportion of the men who purchase prostitutes' services are amenable to educational programs, 'treatment', or deterrence (Wilcox et al., 2009). The last part of the paper turns to reducing derived demand aimed at the employers and third parties, who recruit, transport, hire and exploit trafficked victims for a profit.

#### *Repressive Measures*

Police from the United States to Finland to Zimbabwe have taken repressive measures to penalize male buyers. The most straightforward measure is the arrest of prostitution clients (sometimes facilitated by the use of undercover female agents). An extensive study by the U.S. Department of Justice in 2007 found that arrest of male buyers reduced the likelihood of future prostitution arrest

---

<sup>11</sup> It must be noted that this particular study used a very small and subjective sample, which may have biased the results.

by approximately 70 percent (Brewer et al., 2007). Investigations of other state police records showed that arrests did not seem to cause a displacement effect to other areas. These results therefore suggest that apprehension of prostitution clients has a significant specific deterrent effect on patronizing behavior. However, the general deterrent effect of arrest of prostitution clients for soliciting can be expected to be small, as only a very small proportion of men visiting prostitutes is arrested (Brewer et al, 2007). The impact of law enforcement strategies on overall demand is thus very low. Additionally, some research has indicated that the fear of arrest can increase demand among risk-seeking men, who purchase sex 'because of the kicks.' Several studies have found that the likelihood of arrest heightens excitement and encourages men motivated by risk to visit prostitutes (Monto, 1999).

Other, more creative repressive measures include anti-cruising ordinances to prevent men from cruising to look for street prostitutes; seizing and impounding the vehicles of men who buy women in prostitution; issuing driving bans to habitual buyers; blocking off streets with cement barriers to prevent men from stopping and soliciting prostitutes on certain streets; and checking identity cards. Citizens in one city formed "citizens' patrols" to alert patrol members to incoming "kerb-crawlers" (those driving around and stopping to solicit prostitutes for sex) and to drive them away. Volunteer members patrol the streets and confronted the kerb-crawlers by waving placards with messages such as "You can't get no satisfaction" and "Get Back Where you Once Belonged" (Kryszko and Raymond, 2006; Hughes, 2004). Although it can be expected that these measures have a larger specific deterrent effect on men purchasing commercial sex acts, especially if family members or spouses are made aware of the offense, little to no empirical evaluations have been conducted to determine the effectiveness of such programs.

#### *Legislative Measures*

To protect the rights of women working in prostitution, a number of countries have legalized the sale, but criminalized the purchase of commercial sex. In Sweden, national legislation defines prostitution as a form of male violence against women and under the Swedish Penal Code, chapter 6, section 11, "a person who ... obtains a casual sexual relation in exchange for payment shall be sentenced for the purchase of a sexual service to a fine or imprisonment for at most six months" (Ministry of Industry, Employment and Communications, 2005:1). The main rationale behind the approach is that when the buyers risk punishment, the consumer demand for buying prostitutes will decrease, which in turn will diminish the profitability of the local prostitution markets. After adoption of the law the number of women involved in (street) prostitution in Sweden has decreased

significantly,<sup>12</sup> although the statistics on trafficked women appear to have remained fairly constant (Ekberg, 2004).

Article 19 of the Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings requires Parties to the convention to consider the criminalization of knowingly using the services of a trafficking victim. One of the considerations for including this provision in the Convention was "...the desire to discourage the demand for exploitable people that drives trafficking in human beings" (Council of Europe, 2005:58).<sup>13</sup>

With respect to human trafficking in the form of child sex tourism, a number of countries have passed legislation allowing for the prosecution of their citizens who travel abroad and engage in sexual relations with children. The U.S. Federal Law Regarding Child Sex Tourism, 18 USC 2423, punishes anyone who "travels with intent to engage in illicit sexual conduct" or those who "engage in illicit sexual conduct in foreign places". This also covers interstate travel within the United States.<sup>14</sup> Under the U.K. Sexual Offences Act, 2003, article 72, persons can be prosecuted for a sexual crime that is viewed as a criminal offence in both countries.<sup>15</sup> Similarly, Australia has passed the Crimes (Child Sex Tourism) Amendment Act 1994 No. 105, 1994, punishing its citizens for having sexual relations with a child under the age of 16 outside of the territory (Aronowitz, 2009).<sup>16</sup> Overall, over thirty countries have passed some type of extra-territorial legislation allowing the country to prosecute its own nationals for crimes that have been committed against children in another country (Svensson, 2006).

---

<sup>12</sup> It is possible that street prostitution has simply been driven underground and sex is sold from private homes or clubs.

<sup>13</sup> This approach has been adopted by a few Parties. For example, holding the client criminally liable when he knowingly uses the services of a trafficked person is an approach adopted in Article 41-A of the Criminal Code of Macedonia. It provides that: "The one that uses or enables another person's usage of sexual service from the person for whom he knows are victims of human trafficking will be punished with from 6 months up to 5 years imprisonment". Croatian legislation follows that of Macedonia by punishing the client if he has knowledge that the person in prostitution has been trafficked (Mattar, 2003:2).

<sup>14</sup> U.S. Federal Law Regarding Child Sex Tourism, 18 USC 2423 at [http://www.worldvision.org/get\\_involved.nsf/467ea108653d7ec987256fb4006c09b1/df2eab2634bed631882571d80062ed70/\\$FILE/U.S.%20Law%20Regarding%20Child%20Sex%20Tourism.pdf?Open&lid=CST\\_Law&lpos=rightnav](http://www.worldvision.org/get_involved.nsf/467ea108653d7ec987256fb4006c09b1/df2eab2634bed631882571d80062ed70/$FILE/U.S.%20Law%20Regarding%20Child%20Sex%20Tourism.pdf?Open&lid=CST_Law&lpos=rightnav)

<sup>15</sup> UK Sexual Offences Act, 2003, article 72, [http://www.opsi.gov.uk/Acts/acts2003/ukpga\\_20030042\\_en\\_5#pt1-pb19-11g72](http://www.opsi.gov.uk/Acts/acts2003/ukpga_20030042_en_5#pt1-pb19-11g72).

<sup>16</sup> Crimes (Child Sex Tourism) Amendment Act 1994 No. 105, 1994, <http://www.comlaw.gov.au/ComLaw/Legislation/Act1.nsf/framelodgmentattachments/332EE746136CDDF6CA256F720018338C>

### *Awareness Raising Campaigns*

To tackle primary demand, awareness-raising campaigns are targeted primarily at (potential) customers of prostitutes, warning them that prostitutes may be victims of trafficking. The particularly powerful campaign of Crime-Stoppers U.K. warns customers of prostitutes: "Walk in a punter (customer), walk out a rapist."<sup>17</sup> A similar poster campaign in Indonesia was aimed at men who visit Indonesia's Batam Island sex area. The message of the poster is clear: "How Would you Feel if Someone did this to Your Daughter?" (Kryszko and Raymond, 2006). The website of the Dutch Crime-Stoppers *Meld Misdaad Anoniem* ('Report Crime Anonymously') reports that a number of valuable tips from customers came into the organization leading to the rescue of victims and the arrest of traffickers.<sup>18</sup>

Awareness-raising campaigns could also be aimed at the general public to raise awareness of the plight of trafficked victims, or to inform them about the health risks involved in commercial sex purchases, working conditions of prostitutes, the influence of street prostitution on neighborhoods and communities, and the legal responses to soliciting. These approaches appear to be promising: for example, in a study of a sample of the Japanese public, Otsuki and Hatano (2009) found that the more a man knew about human trafficking, the more likely he was to indicate objections to buying sexual services.

A third group which could be susceptible to these campaigns are third parties who may come into contact with prostitutes (such as taxi and limousine drivers or hotel personnel) and who may (unknowingly) be facilitating human trafficking. In these cases, hotels should be informed and held accountable if personnel such as concierges are found to arrange encounters between hotel guests and prostitutes who may be trafficked, or if hotel employees exploit their staff for these purposes. Awareness-raising campaigns may prompt these parties to (anonymously) report information on prostitutes whom they suspect to be trafficked.

### *Social and Cultural Measures*

A number of programs in Canada and the United States have involved the "naming and shaming" of men who were arrested while soliciting for prostitution. In the hope of using public embarrassment to discourage and deter (also future) buyers, police departments have taken measures such as publishing the clients' names and photos in newspapers or videos on the internet and television. In one city, officials reported that such publication helped cut solicitation by customers by about 40 percent. In another U.S. city, police not only posted pictures of the men arrested for soliciting, but also provided their names, birth dates and

<sup>17</sup> Crime Stoppers, <http://www.crimestoppers-uk.org/media-centre/crime-in-the-news/may-2008--crime-in-the-news/walk-in-a-punter-walk-out-a-rapist>

<sup>18</sup> See the website report at <http://www.meldmisdaadanoniem.nl/english/human-trafficking/>

hometowns.<sup>19</sup> Other programs use public billboards to humiliate those who have purchased prostitutes (Hughes, 2004; Kryszko and Raymond, 2006).

Educational programs have targeted men who have been arrested for solicitation for prostitution. The education of customers of prostitutes has taken the form of programs such as the First Offender Prostitution Program in the United States (commonly referred to as "john schools"). The program was designed to reduce the demand for commercial sex by educating "customers" about the negative consequences of prostitution. Men arrested for soliciting prostitutes were given the option of being prosecuted or paying a fee and attending a one-day class.

Studies on the effectiveness of these john school programs show diverse results. An evaluation of the program in San Francisco found that "it has been effective in substantially reducing recidivism among men arrested for soliciting prostitutes" (Shively et al., 2008:4); the city boasts of a sharp decrease in reoffending rates to around one percent as a result of their pre-trial program for first-time offenders (Wilcox et al., 2009). Assessments of Toronto's john school workshops suggest that the programs succeeded in informing men about the personal risks of buying sex and the Canadian prostitution law as well as in raising awareness of the victims and dangers associated with the sex industry (Wortley et al., 2002). After attending the program, men were more likely to accept responsibility for their actions and more likely to admit that they might have a sex addiction. However, these attitudinal changes did not translate into significant changes in anticipated future behavior.<sup>20</sup> In another study, Monto and Garcia (2001) compared heterosexual men attending a john school workshop with offenders who did not attend the workshop. All of the men were arrested for soliciting for prostitution in Portland, Oregon. The researchers found no statistically significant differences between the groups; however, it should be noted that the recidivism rates in both groups were very low.<sup>21</sup> This supports the hypothesis of Brewer and colleagues (2007) that post-arrest interventions or extra penalties of soliciting may not have a noticeable impact given the large specific deterrent effect of arrest, because there may be little additional deterrence that could be achieved.

Other educational programs such as faith-based healing and counseling programs are rehabilitative in nature and usually address a broader set of

---

<sup>19</sup> In the first 24 hours that the site was operative, there were 4,100 hits.

<sup>20</sup> The majority (approx. 90%) of the men indicated they would probably not visit a prostitute again, but this result cannot be attributed to the workshop. During a pre-workshop interview, 12.8% of the respondents indicated that they would definitely or maybe use prostitutes in the future; this figure only dropped slightly to 11% after attendance, which was a statistically insignificant difference (Wortley et al., 2002).

<sup>21</sup> It should be noted that this study used a relatively small sample of 215; overall, only 3 men (1.4 percent) were caught re-offending during the two years following the arrest that led to their inclusion in the study.

behaviors related to 'sexual addiction' and emotional and psychological problems rather than purchasing sex acts (Hughes, 2004).

A more long term strategy focusing on the reduction in the overall demand for prostitution requires "...long term awareness raising and educational work to bring about a fundamental re-visioning of sexuality, age, gender relations and prostitution. Such campaigns would need to target young people in particular" (Anderson and O'Connell Davidson, 2004:9). Lederer (2009) refers to this demand reduction strategy as a social marketing campaign aimed at educating and raising awareness among boys and young men.

Projects in Canada, France, Indonesia, the Philippines and the United States have attempted to challenge and change the sexual attitudes and practices of men and boys. The projects challenge men in recognizing their role as buyers of women in prostitution and educate men and boys to the harm of prostitution and trafficking. One campaign in France used prominent men to sign a statement recognizing prostitution as violence and to pledge not to engage in prostitution and rape stressing that men recognize a form of masculinity based on mutual respect, not domination (Kryszko and Raymond, 2006).

### **Measures Addressing Derived Demand**

Derived demand is generated by persons who make a profit from the trafficked victims. For these persons, trafficking is a business aimed at increasing profits while reducing costs and risks. In order to eliminate the demand for trafficked victims generated by this group of persons, it is essential that measures be taken to reduce the profit and increase the risks and costs of human trafficking. These concepts are intricately related, as measures which increase the cost to traffickers should at the same time reduce the profits. Sex trafficking can be combated by reducing the demand for exploitative sex. This in turn should affect the market's profitability.

Commercial sex is a highly elastic product. In business terms, this means that if the price of an object or service increases, consumer demand will decrease. By elevating risk to traffickers, this will increase the price of the services they provide resulting in a decreased demand and diminished profit (Kara, 2009). Profit will also be reduced if heavy fines and seizure of assets are imposed on convicted traffickers.

Measures to reduce profits and increase costs and risks include, but are not limited to, measures to educate the public; reform police, prosecutorial, and judicial systems to eradicate corruption; protect migrants by verifying job applications; increased funding and training for stakeholders to identify high risk victims, situations and markets susceptible to trafficking; improved and increased passport controls; the creation of mixed national and international investigation teams; proactive controls and periodic risk assessments; creating local

multidisciplinary groups to monitor vulnerable sectors, increasing the likelihood of arrest and prosecution – also for enablers<sup>22</sup> and customers –; increasing penalties; adopting comprehensive legislation; conducting financial investigations and providing for administrative controls to allow for the closure of businesses that knowingly use trafficked persons. All of these measures and the impact that they would have on the trafficking business, and thus the demand for trafficked persons, are outlined in the table below.

---

<sup>22</sup> Enablers are those that assist in trafficking while they may not be part of the trafficking organization. These could include concierges in hotels or taxi drivers bringing trafficked victims to customers.

**Table 1: Measures to Raise Costs and Risks and Reduce Profits in Human Trafficking<sup>23</sup>**

Measures	Effect	Upon Whom
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Public education efforts to warn vulnerable people about how traffickers operate</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Lowers the recruitment yield per dollar and raises recruiters' total costs</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Recruiter</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Public education directed at unwitting enablers such as customers of commercial prostitution</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Lowers profit</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Owners and traffickers</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Reform police, judicial, and other official systems to make them less corruptible and eradicate corruption</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Raises the costs and risks</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Traffickers and owners of illicit business operations</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Insistence or encouragement by "sending" countries that their vulnerable citizens are protected when they go abroad;</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Raises the risk of discovery and/or forces traffickers to adopt higher-cost ways around their current recruitment approaches.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Traffickers</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Monitor websites and communications where the trafficking victims are advertised</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Raises risk of being discovered</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Traffickers</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Increased funding and training for police, border guards, labor inspectorates and other stakeholders in identifying markets, situations and places in which trafficking occurs</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Raises risk, increases costs</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Traffickers</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Better passport, visa, and border controls to identify persons who are possible victims</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Raises risk</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Traffickers / transporters</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Introduce mixed national and international joint investigation teams to increase likelihood of arrest and overcome corruption</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Raises risk, increases costs</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Traffickers and transporters</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Proactive controls of businesses in high risk markets</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Raises risk</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Owners</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Periodic risk assessments in vulnerable markets</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Raises risk</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Traffickers</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Support the creation of local multi-disciplinary or referral groups to monitor vulnerable sectors, identify and 'rescue' victims of trafficking</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Raises risk, lowers profits</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Traffickers and owners</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Adoption of legislation prohibiting and providing adequate punishment for all forms of human trafficking</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Raises risk of punishment</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Traffickers</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Increase likelihood of arrest and successful prosecution and punishment of traffickers and enablers; this could also include customers (solicitation for prostitution) of prostitution or producers, sellers, distributors and buyers of pornography</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Lowers profit, raises risk and costs</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Traffickers and owners</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Increase success of prosecution and sentences for convicted traffickers</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Raises risk, raises costs</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Traffickers</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Conduct financial investigation and seize all assets purchased with proceeds from human trafficking (provide remuneration or compensation to victims)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Lowers Profits</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Traffickers</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Provide for administrative approaches to controlling trafficking through withdrawal or refusal to issue licenses to businesses suspected or convicted of using trafficked persons</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Raises risk and cost, lowers profit</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Traffickers, owners</li> </ul>

## Concluding Remarks

A balanced approach to eradicating human trafficking requires measures aimed at the root causes of migration and trafficking in source countries: poverty, gender inequality, violence against women, lack of educational and employment opportunities, corruption, government suppression and civil wars. Long-term sustainable strategies in source countries include the eradication of poverty and

<sup>23</sup> This table is a slightly modified version of Table 6.1 prepared by the author for the OSCE and UN.GIFT report *Analyzing the Business Organization of Trafficking in Human Beings in Order to Decrease Vulnerabilities and to Better Prevent the Crime* (Aronowitz, 2010). Information in this table was taken in part from Pennington *et al.* (2009:131).

corruption and the provision of education, jobs and career opportunities for the most vulnerable populations in the society. Governments and society must ensure gender equality and focus on the reduction of discrimination and violence in the family aimed at women and children (Aronowitz, 2010). At the same time, demand for trafficked victims' services and labor must be addressed in the source, transit and destination countries.

Demand is a multi-faceted problem generated by different actors at different times during the trafficking process. To end the exploitation of trafficked victims within the commercial sex market, it is necessary to address measures that reduce the both demand generated by clients and customers of prostituted persons and (child) pornography, as well as the derived demand generated by employers, pimps, traffickers and those who profit from the exploitation of trafficked victims.

In the battle against primary demand, legislative and repressive measures may have limited success – or result in displacement of the problem to other areas. For more long term changes in demand and customer behavior, educational, social and cultural measures must be implemented, in particular, those measures aimed at changing men's their attitude towards prostitution, paid sex and (child) pornography. One of the most important determinants of the trafficking market's profitability is the consumer who demands cheap goods and commercial sex services supplied by the traffickers. It is therefore crucial that these consumers become aware of the influence of their consumption patterns and behavior. Post-capitalist market values and advertisement campaigns have resulted in a socially construed and cultivated consumer demand for goods and services that are perceived as necessary, but that in reality are not vitally important. As Anderson and O'Connell Davidson (2003:41) note, "human beings are not born wishing to buy commercial sexual services or to pay someone else to clean, cook and care for them, any more than they are born with specific desires to play the lottery or drink Coca-Cola." The demystification of social norms that perpetuate attitudes favorable to human trafficking, labor exploitation and the oppression of women should therefore be one of our main concerns. The potential force of public opinion, guided by the media, can set norms and moral standards for employers and enterprises which could ultimately lead to the eradication of human trafficking.

With respect to demand created by employers and third parties – derived demand – approaches should focus heavily upon increasing the costs and risks to traffickers which will drive up the price of services for the customer and reduce the market's profitability. These demand reduction measures, coupled with more permanent solutions to improve situations in countries of origin that create a supply of trafficked victims, will contribute to ending human trafficking.

## REFERENCES

- Anderson, B. and J. O'Connell Davidson (2002), *Trafficking – a demand led problem?*  
Save the Children, Stockholm.
- Anderson, B. and J. O'Connell Davidson (2003), *Is Trafficking in Human Beings Demand Driven? A Multi-Country Pilot Study*, International Organization for Migration, Geneva, Switzerland;  
[http://www.childtrafficking.com/Docs/anderson\\_\\_\\_o\\_connell\\_dauids1.pdf](http://www.childtrafficking.com/Docs/anderson___o_connell_dauids1.pdf)
- Anderson, B. and J. O'Connell Davidson (2004), *Trafficking – A demand led problem? Part I – Review of Evidence and Debates*, Save the Children, Stockholm, Sweden.
- Aronowitz, Alexis .A. (2004), "Victimization of Trafficked Persons and Illegal Migrants", *International Review of Victimology*, Volume 11, 2004; 11-32.
- Aronowitz, Alexis A. (2006), *Measures to Combat Trafficking in Human Beings in Benin, Nigeria and Togo*, United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, Vienna, September 2006; at [http://www.unodc.org/documents/human-trafficking/ht\\_research\\_report\\_nigeria.pdf](http://www.unodc.org/documents/human-trafficking/ht_research_report_nigeria.pdf)
- Aronowitz, Alexis A. (2009), *Human Trafficking, Human Misery: The Global Trade in Human Beings*, Praeger Publishers, Westport, CT.;
- Aronowitz, A.A. (2010), *Analyzing the Business Model of Trafficking in Human Beings in order to Decrease Vulnerabilities and to Better Prevent the Crime*. Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe and the United Nations Global Initiative to Fight Trafficking, Vienna, Austria.
- Bales, Kevin (no date). *Understanding the demand behind human trafficking*. Working Paper, Free The Slaves. Available online: [http://lastradainternational.com/Isidocs/520%20bales\\_\\_understanding\\_the\\_de.pdf](http://lastradainternational.com/Isidocs/520%20bales__understanding_the_de.pdf)
- Bales, Kevin (2000). *Expendable people: Slavery in the age of globalization*. *Journal of International Affairs*, 53(2), 461-484.
- Bales, Kevin (2004). *Disposable people: New slavery in the global economy* (revised ed.). Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.
- Bales, Kevin (2005), *Understanding Global Slavery*, University of California Press, Berkeley and Los Angeles, California.
- Brewer, D.P., Potterat, J.J., Muth, S.Q., Roberts, J.M., Dudek, J.A., & Woodhouse, D.E. (2007). *Clients of prostitute women: Deterrence, prevalence, characteristics and violence*. Washington DC: National Institute of Justice.
- Carter, V. (2003). *Providing services to African American prostituted women*. In M. Farley (Ed.), *Prostitution, Trafficking and Post Traumatic Stress* (pp 213-222). Binghamton, NY: Haworth Press.

Council of Europe, *Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings and its Explanatory Report*, Warsaw, Poland;

[http://www.coe.int/t/dghl/monitoring/trafficking/Source/PDF\\_Conv\\_197\\_Trafficking\\_E.pdf](http://www.coe.int/t/dghl/monitoring/trafficking/Source/PDF_Conv_197_Trafficking_E.pdf)

Crawford, T. (2009, June 7). Recession means tough times for sex workers. *The Toronto Star*. Retrieved from <http://www.thestar.com/living/article/646871--recession-means-tough-times-for-sex-workers#article>

Danailova-Trainor, G. and Patrick Belser (2006), *Globalization and the illicit market for human trafficking: an empirical analysis of supply and demand*, International Labour Office, Geneva, [http://www.ungift.org/docs/ungift/pdf/knowledge/ilo\\_wcms\\_081931.pdf](http://www.ungift.org/docs/ungift/pdf/knowledge/ilo_wcms_081931.pdf)

Ekberg, G. (2004). The Swedish law that prohibits the purchase of sexual services. *Violence against Women*, 10(10), 1187-1218.

Europol (2009, Dec). *Trafficking in human beings in the European Union: A Europol perspective*. Europol.

Goward, P. (2003), Australian Human Rights Commission, Stop the Traffic 2 Conference, Closing Address, [http://www.hreoc.gov.au/sex\\_discrimination/publication/traffic/speeches/goward.html](http://www.hreoc.gov.au/sex_discrimination/publication/traffic/speeches/goward.html)

Hughes, D. (2004), Best Practices to Address the Demand Side of Sex Trafficking. Washington D.C.: U.S. Department of State.

Hughes, D. (2005), *The Demand for Victims of Sex Trafficking*, <http://www.ashanet.org/focusgroups/sanctuary/articles/Demand%20for%20Victims%20of%20Sex%20Trafficking.doc>.

International Labour Organization (ILO), (2002), *A future without child labour*, ILC 90th Session, 2002, Report I (B).

International Labour Organization (ILO), (2005), *A global alliance against forced labour*, ILC, 93rd Session, 2005, Report I (B).

International Labour Organization [ILO] (2006). *The demand side of human trafficking in Asia: Empirical findings*. Bangkok: International Labour Office.

Kara, S. (2009), *Sex trafficking: inside the business of modern slavery*, New York: Columbia University Press.

Kryszko, B. and J. Raymond (2006), Good Practices: Targeting the Demand For Prostitution and Trafficking, *Coalition Against Trafficking in Women*, [http://action.web.ca/home/catw/readingroom.shtml?x=71327&AA\\_EX\\_Session=794bc5fab1e5f8a943336c60bd545b5b](http://action.web.ca/home/catw/readingroom.shtml?x=71327&AA_EX_Session=794bc5fab1e5f8a943336c60bd545b5b)

Laczko, F., & Gramegna, M.A. (2003). Developing better indicators of human trafficking. *Brown Journal of World Affairs*, 10(1), 179-194.

Lederer, L.J., (2009), "Addressing Demand: Examining New Practices", Global Centurion, Monday, October 26, 2009; <http://www.facebook.com/notes/global-centurion/addressing-demand-examining-new-practices-by-laura-j-lederer-jd/180204359877>

Månsson, S.A. (2004). Men's practices in prostitution and their implications for social work. In S.A. Månsson & C. Proveyer (Eds.), *Social Work in Cuba and Sweden: Achievements and Prospects*. ENATW. Retrieved from [http://www.aretusa.net/download/centro%20documentazione/03contributi/c-05Men\\_practices.doc](http://www.aretusa.net/download/centro%20documentazione/03contributi/c-05Men_practices.doc)

Mattar, M. (2003), "The Appropriate Legal Responses to the Issue of Demand: A Comparative Legal Analysis", conference paper, Conference on "Demand Dynamics: The Forces of Demand in Global Sex Trafficking" October 16-17, 2003, Chicago, Illinois; [http://www.childtrafficking.com/Docs/mattar\\_project\\_04\\_0808.pdf](http://www.childtrafficking.com/Docs/mattar_project_04_0808.pdf)

Ministry of Industry, Employment and Communications (Regeringskansliet) (2005), *Prostitution and trafficking in human beings*, Stockholm, Sweden, April 2005; [http://www.nordicbaltic-assistwomen.net/IMG/pdf/Sweden\\_Factsheet\\_on\\_Prostitution\\_and\\_Trafficking-2.pdf](http://www.nordicbaltic-assistwomen.net/IMG/pdf/Sweden_Factsheet_on_Prostitution_and_Trafficking-2.pdf)

Monto, M.A. (1999). *Focusing on the clients of street prostitutes: A creative approach to reducing violence against women*. Submitted to the National Institute of Justice, October 30, 1999. Retrieved from [www.ncjrs.org/pdffiles1/nij/grants/182860.pdf](http://www.ncjrs.org/pdffiles1/nij/grants/182860.pdf)

Monto, M.A., & Garcia, S. (2001). Recidivism among the customers of female street prostitutes: Do intervention programs help? *Western Criminology Review*, 3(2), 1-10.

Newman, G. (2006), *The Exploitation of Trafficked Women*, COPS, U.S. Department of Justice, 2006; <http://www.cops.usdoj.gov/mime/open.pdf?Item=1699>

Otsuki, N., & Hatano, K. (2009). Japanese perceptions of trafficking in persons: An analysis of the 'demand' for sexual services and policies for dealing with trafficking survivors. *Social Science Journal Japan*, 12(1), 45-70.

Passas, N. (1999). Globalization, criminogenic asymmetries and economic crime. *European Journal of Law Reform*, 1, 399-423.

Pennington, J. R., A. D. Ball, R. Hampton, J. Soulakova (2009), "The Cross-National Market in Human Beings, *Journal of Macromarketing*, Volume 29 Number 2, pp. 119 – 134.

Raymond, J. G. "Prostitution on Demand: Legalizing the Buyers as Sexual Consumers. Special Issue: The Case Against Legalizing Prostitution", *Violence*

*Against Women : an International and Interdisciplinary Journal*, Vol. 10, No.10, Sage, 2004.

Roby, J.L., & Tanner, J. (2009). Supply and demand: Prostitution and sexual trafficking in Northern Thailand. *Geographical Compass*, 3(1), 89-107.

Salt, J., & Hogarth, J. (2000). *Migrant trafficking and human smuggling in Europe: A review of the evidence with case studies from Hungary, Poland and Ukraine*. Geneva: International Organization for Migration.

Schloenhardt, A. (1999). Organized crime and the business of migrant trafficking: An economic analysis. *Crime, Law and Social Change*, 32(3), 203-233.

Shelley, L. (2010, forthcoming), *Human Trafficking: A Global Perspective*, Cambridge University Press.

Shively, M., S. Jalbert, R. Kling, W. Rhodes, R. Finn, C. Flyage, L. Tierney, D. Hunt, D. Squires, C. Dyos & K. Wheeler (2008), *Final Report on the Evaluation of the First Offender Prostitution Program*, National Institute of Justice, U.S. Department of Justice,

<http://www.ncjrs.gov/pdffiles1/nij/grants/221894.pdf>.

Svensson, N., "Extraterritorial Accountability: An Assessment of the Effectiveness of Child Sex Tourism Laws" *Loyola of Los Angeles International and Comparative Law Review*, Vol, 28, 2006, pp. 641-664, [http://lr.lls.edu/documents/Article6Svensson\\_000.pdf](http://lr.lls.edu/documents/Article6Svensson_000.pdf)

Wilcox, A., Christmann, K., Rogerson, M., & Birch, P. (2009). *Tackling the demand for prostitution: A rapid evidence assessment of the published research literature*. Home Office, Research Report 27.

Williams, P. (1997). Trafficking in women and children: A market perspective. *Transnational Organized Crime*, 3(4), 145-170.

Wortley, S., Fischer, B., & Webster, C. (2002). Vice lessons: A survey of prostitution offenders enrolled in the Toronto John School Diversion Program. *Canadian Journal of Criminology*, 44(4), 369-402.

United Nations (2010), *Good practices and tools in reducing the demand for exploitative service; Background paper prepared by the Secretariat*, document CTOC/COP/WG.4/2010/3, Vienna, 27-29 January 2010; [http://www.unodc.org/documents/treaties/organized\\_crime/2010\\_CTOC\\_COP\\_WG4/WG4\\_2010\\_3\\_E.pdf](http://www.unodc.org/documents/treaties/organized_crime/2010_CTOC_COP_WG4/WG4_2010_3_E.pdf).

United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) (2009), *Global Report on Trafficking in Persons*, Vienna, Austria.

United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) (2012), *Global Report on Trafficking in Persons*, Vienna, Austria.

U.S. Department of Justice, "Florida Man Part of Mexican Trafficking Ring Pleads Guilty to Involuntary Servitude Charges", September 13, 2002; [http://www.usdoj.gov/opa/pr/2002/September/02\\_crt\\_525.htm](http://www.usdoj.gov/opa/pr/2002/September/02_crt_525.htm)

U.S. Department of State (2010), *Trafficking in Persons Report 2010*, Washington, D.C.

U.S. State Department (2010), *Trafficking in Persons Report 2010*, Washington, D.C.